Why and how ideology matters for Language Management Theory

KIMURA Goro Christoph Sophia University 5th LM symposium, Regensburg 2017

Structure of the presentation

- 1. Some evolutions in LMT
- 2. How interest and power relate to language
- 3. Interest and power in LMT
- 4. Language Ideology as an approach to interest and power
- 5. Integrating Language Ideology in LMT
- 6. A case of micro-level operation of Language Ideology (Sorbian case)
- 7. Conclusions



1. SOME EVOLUTIONS IN LMT

Centrality of process in LMT

Classical model:

- 1 noting of a deviation from the norm
- 2 (negative) evaluation
- 3 adjustment design
- 4 implementation

Evolution 1: middle of the process

Discovery of other types of evaluations:

There can be also <i>positive evaluations: gratifications

(NEUSTUPNÝ 2003. 'Japanese students in Prague. Problems of communication and interaction.' *International Journal of the Sociology of Language* 162: 125–143) Revision 1: Possibility of various evaluations

- 1 noting of a deviation from the norm
- 2 (negative, positive, neutral ...) evaluation
- 3 adjustment design
- 4 implementation

Evolution 2: beginning of the process

Discovery of other types to begin management:

the beginning of the management process need not

be triggered by a deviation from norm

(Nekvapil & Sherman (eds.) 2009, *Language Management in Contact Situations: Perspectives from Three Continents*. (see e.g. Mariott, Nemoto); Marriott & Nekvapil 2012, Language Management Approach - Probing the Concept of 'Noting'. *Journal of Asian Pacific Communication* 22:2)

Cf. pre-(interaction) management (Nekvapil/Sherman 2009, Pre-interaction management in multinational companies in Central Europe, *Current Issues in LP*),

management towards interaction (Muraoka et al.)

Revision 2: Possibility of various beginnings

- 1 noting of a language phenomenon,
 - e.g. deviation from the norm or expectation
- 2 evaluation
- 3 adjustment design

4 implementation

#This evolution does not neglect the importance of norm or expectation nor does it exclude deviations as trigger. It just makes possible to includes also other possibilities of language management occurring in the real world. If LM wants to deal with the sum of metalinguistic activities, the model has to be comprehensive.

Evolution 3: Ending of the process

(Re)discovery of the post-implementation stage:

"feedback, or post-implementation evaluation can be a regular part of the management process, as it is something we do normally in our daily interaction and communication practices."(Kimura, G.C. 2014: Language management as a cyclical process. *Slovo a slovesnost* 75, 267)





Comparison with general policy model



Comparison with general education process model

(language) education process model



Comparison with general problem management model [main phases] (Lanstyák 2014, *Slovo a Slovesnost* 75)

- o. Deviation
- 1. Noting
- 2. Problem identification
- 3. Problem analysis
- 4. Action design
- Implementation
- 6. Verification (evaluation)

Compatibility with (nearly all) other general approaches to human bevahior

"resist disciplinary closure of thought and enquiry: planning theory must answer to general planning theory, problem-solving models to general problem-solving theory, economics to general economics (...)" (Jernudd 1997: The [R]Evolution of Sociolinguistics, 137)

 \Rightarrow and LMT to general human (inter)action management theory!

Revision 3: Possibility of the post-implementation stage

1 noting of a language phenomenon, e.g. deviation from the norm or expectation

- 2 evaluation
- 3 adjustent design
- 4 implementation

5 feedback

#This evolution does not imply that feedback must always happen. It is generally accepted that not every LM must include all these stages. The addition of the fifth stage is useful to draw attention to this (very likely) possibility, even if another management cycle does not begin.

LM Process as cycle



Ianguage management can (...) recommence in a cyclical manner" (Mariott & Nekvapil 2012: 156)

showing this possibility *explicitly* contributes to :

- Better understanding the link between management processes (micro and macro)
- Help drawing attention to the possibility of feedback in simple management
- Improve the ability of LMT to analyze organized management
- Increase the compatibility with other process models and
- strengthens its position among other theories on human activities.

(Kimura 2014)

Example 1: Kimura 2015, The researcher as part of language management processes, 4th LMT Symposium

Stages	Researchers Behaviour
Noting	Opinion gap on learning Polish
Evaluation	Lack of awareness on already (tentatively) practicized releasing strategies
Adjustment / Action design	Application and reaction to chances and offers for publication / presentation
Implementation	Provide information and suggestions
Verification/feedback	Reflexions on the activities

Example 2: Shen 2016, Saving Shanghai Dialect: A Case for Bottom-Up Language Planning in China, *Asia-Pacific Edu Res* 25(5–6)

Table 2 A coding structure for the interview data

First-order processes (stages)	Second-order themes	Third-order concepts
Noting the crisis of Shanghai dialect	Perceptions of linguistic insecurity	Weakening proficiency
		Few qualified young speakers
		Dialect decline
		Deviated norm
	The awareness of language insecurity in status and identity	Dialect prohibited in public usage
		Switch to speak Putonghua in business context
		Shanghai dialect as a name card with cultural values
Evaluation of the dialect in a 'crisis'	Arguing for evaluation of the 'crisis'	Generational transmission stopped
		Online appealing and voting for saving Shanghai diale
		Should be ranked on the agenda of endangered language list
	Framing the cultural crisis of Haipai	A sign of crisis of Haipai culture
		Remain as the only symbol of the local identity
Adjustment plans for language planning	Plans and strategies proposed for adjustment	To increase dialect usage
		To teach Shanghai dialect in schools and kindergarter
		To develop a writing system and standardization
		To support creative and literary writing
	Challenging the push for Putonghua	To abolish the prohibition on the use in schools and kindergartens
		To stop the push for Putonghua (停止'推普')
		To slow down the push for Putonghua ('推普' 减速)
		The Language Law in need of revision
Implementation of relevant language policy initiative	Policy shifts in response to cultural crisis	Ad hoc projects to investigate
		To provide Shanghai dialect broadcast service
		Dialect-medium TV and radio programs on air
		Pilot programs of cultural experience in dialect
	Policy constraints in regard to dialect protection	'Unrealistic' to abolish or even undermine the policy promote Putonghua
		Reluctant to take specific measures to protect Shangh- dialect
		Cautious about the feasibility of implementation in educational contexts
eedback on implementation	Nuanced changes in dialect planning	Preservation and protection are different
		No substantial changes
		Pilot programs are not enough
		Need more exposures to Shanghai dialect in and out o class
	Calling for a paradigm shift in dialect	Demands remained unchanged
	planning	Neglecting voices at the bottom

Evolution 4?: Including Language Ideology in LMT

Starting point: common, yet ambivalent (unclear) theoretical position of "ideology" in LMT

2. HOW INTEREST AND POWER RELATE TO LANGUAGE



Language and power

Language and power are intimately related. Language indexes the power relationships of a society and naturalizes them. It reinforces power relationships. Language is a tool in the creation and recreation of power. (Fairclough, N. 2001. Language and *power*. London: Longman)

Aspect 1: the impossibility of neutrality about language

Wee 2011, Language without Rights, OUP

"Language differs from practices pertaining to religion, diet, or dress in that it is *unavoidable*. Unlike other cultural practices, it is simply impossible in most, if not all, situations to avoid the use of a specific language, since some form of communication is necessary if the participating individuals or communities are to successfully coordinate their actions."(15)

Therefore "language is always inextricably intertwined with potentially conflicting interests"(17)

Aspect 2: The intersubjectivity of language (Wee 2011)

"language is ultimately a semiotic resource whose properties in the context of any localized situation are intersubjectively negotiated. (...) the fact that they are intersubjectively negotiated means that any control over them is beyond the reach of any single individual or community, however powerful."(Wee 2011:163)

<-> physical power

- -> today, power often operates through language
- -> special affinity with and significance for LMT

3. INTEREST AND POWER IN LMT



Jernudd & Neustupný (1987)

"A systematic study of differential interest in language management must apply a framework such as the above one, and it must relate «interest» to each of the components of the management process." (76)

"Each language management process is connected with multiple interests of particular social groups or individuals. A full analysis of different interests is necessary." (82) Neustupný 2002: Language and Power into the 21st Century paper prepared for the conference Language and Empowerment, organized by the Malaysian Association of Modern Languages, April 11-13, 2002 at the Petaling Jaya Hilton, Kuala Lumpur

Definitions:

"Interests are aspirations for a certain state of affairs that is favourable to the subject. Power operates on interests. Power is the capacity to implement one's interests" (4) Neustupný/Nekvapil 2003: Language management in the Czech Republic. *Current Issues in Language Planning*, 4 (3&4)

"A fourth feature is the insistence on the recognition of the multiplicity of interests within a community. (...) Also, the capacity to implement one's interests, in other words power, are subject to variation, and no language management system can overlook this fact. (...)"(186)

interest (1983-), power (1996-)

Recent examples

- macro: Dovalil 2015, Language management theory as a basis for the dynamic concept of EU language law, *Current Issues in Language Planning* 16:4.
- micro: Fairbrother 2015, The management of language and power in intercultural contact situations in Japan, *Int. J Sociology of Language* 232.

Question

How far are these concepts really integrated in the theory?



- The invisibility of interest and power in the so central process models of LMT (attention to interest and power can be easily omitted)
- Lack of a clear concept and methodology how to deal with interest and power

4. LANGUAGE IDEOLOGY AS AN APPROACH TO INTEREST AND POWER



Prerequisites of power

(Hashizume 2004 [Japanese book]: language, sex/gender and power as basic elements of society)

'the cumulated effect of layers of past actions regulate present actions, and form the situation wherein actions develop'(129)

- power operates through the <u>understanding and</u> <u>approval</u> of concerned parties on this 'cumulative effect'. (131)
- $\rightarrow\,$ language ideology as an theoretical construct to grasp how the cumulative effect is understood and approved.

Spolsky, 2004 *Language Policy*, CUP

"The members of a speech community share also a general set of beliefs about appropriate language practices, sometimes forming a consensual ideology, assigning values and prestige to various aspects of the language varieties used in it. These beliefs both derive from and influence practices. They can be a basis for language management or a management policy can be intended to confirm or modify them." (14)

Julia de Bres, Language ideologies for constructing inclusion and exclusion, in: Bárat, Studer and Nekvapil (eds.). *Ideological Conceptualizations of Language. Discourses of Linguistic Diversity.* 2013

Language Ideologies:

Theoretical and Methodological Concepts

- 1. normative \neq language attitudes
- 2. system of related beliefs about language, sets of beliefs
- 5. property of *all individuals*
- 7. Existence of dominant language ideologies
- 8. possibility of hegemonic language ideologies:
- 9. always subject to contestation and challenge
- 10. possibility of mixed language ideologies
- 11. relationship between ideologies and identity
- 12. multi-sited

Cont.

Julia de Bres, **Language ideologies for constructing inclusion and exclusion**, in: Bárat, Studer and Nekvapil (eds.). *Ideological Conceptualizations of Language. Discourses of Linguistic Diversity.* 2013

- 3. "tied to interest"
- "given their normative nature and relationship to interests, language ideologies always relate to *power relations* within society."(59)
- 6. "language ideologies are viewed here not as a static system of normative beliefs, but rather as a *strategic resource* that individuals can employ to position and reinforce their own **interests**."(60)

5. INTEGRATING LANGUAGE IDEOLOGY IN LMT


ideology in LMT (selection by chance)

- Jernudd & Neustupný 1987
- Neustupný 1989, 1993, 1997, 2002
- Sherman 2009
- Sloboda 2009
- Kon 2011
- Dovalil 2013
- Lanstyák 2014
- Nekula 2014
- Jernudd 2015
- etc.

Kimura 2011/2017 Working paper in LMT No.2 http://languagemanagement.ff.cuni.cz/bibliography#2017 shared language ideologies can role as constraints, but

- Is a resources in processes negotiating norms. We could assume that norms would not work without reference to shared LI and perhaps even go further to assert that norms would not work without reference to LI which are accepted by the participants. (...)
- Regarding further research, it can be assumed that language ideology can essentially contribute to clarify why such kind of management processes arise, while language management can help to explore how language ideologies operate.

Nekvapil and Sherman, 2013, Language ideologies and linguistic practice: The case of multinational companies in Central Europe in: Bárat, Studer and Nekvapil (eds.). *Ideological Conceptualizations of Language. Discourses of Linguistic Diversity.* 2013

"This paper argues that language ideologies represent a normative orientation for the speakers, and in serving as the basis for norms or expectations for communicative behaviour, the ideologies guide, influence or underlie what can be noticed as a deviation from the norm, what can be evaluated (negatively, positively or otherwise) and so forth, that is, they guide management processes" (86)

cont. Nekvapil and Sherman, 2013

"we would like to provide support for the hypothesis that any given setting contains a constellation of language ideologies which then influence observable practices of language management." (86)

cont. Nekvapil and Sherman, 2013

- "Given the language management framework, we would like to address the question how language ideologies are connected to language management, which entails three more specific questions:
- How do language ideologies underlie/guide organized management?
- How do language ideologies underlie/guide simple management?
- What does the relationship look like between language ideologies underlying simple management and those underlying organized management?" (92)

Lanstyák 2016,

Working paper in LMT No.1, 5

"Moje doterajšie terénne výskumy sa sústredili najmä na dve skupiny jazykových ideológií: 1. ideológie týkajúce sa tzv. organizovaného jazykového manažmentu, najmä tradičnej jazykovej kultúry;

2. ideológie týkajúce sa tzv. jednoduchého

jazykového manažmentu.

[Language Ideology: macro and micro]

micro -> macro

"Simple language management activities on the micro level of interaction not only represent ad hoc solutions for communication and interaction problems, but also reflect linguistic standards that are the result of activities of organized language management. Therefore, activities of simple language management are a source for the analysis of the (linguistic) ideologies of an organization on the macro level."(151) (Marx and Nekula, 2015, Constructing a cross-border space through semiotic landscapes, in: Mikko Laitinen / Anastassia Zabrodskaja (eds.): Dimensions of Sociolinguistic Landscapes in Europe. Materials and Methodological Solutions, Peter Lang)

macro -> micro

"Even minor corrections may be motivated by these factors [language ideologies etc.], e.g. the mere fact that the speaker corrects a language form which does not cause misunderstanding or is not more difficult to understand than the correct one, may be influenced by his/her ideologies."

(Lanstyák 2014, On the process of language problem management, *Slovo a slovesnost* 75, 332)

Simple and Organized Language Management

http://languagemanagement.ff.cuni.cz/en/complexity

Example 1 (from Nekvapil 2000: 174)

Original language:

MODERÁTOR: témata, o kterých bude dnes řeč, možná poznáte už podle jmen pánů, který- kteří přijali dnešní pozvání.

English translation:

ANCHOR: the topics which will be discussed today you may recognize just from the names of the gentlemen who- [non-standard] who [standard] accepted today's invitation.

 \rightarrow Standard language ideology is involved here.

"analyzer's paradox"

- The more we want to analyze macro (transsituational) level, the more we need micro analysis
- The more we want to analyze the micro level, the more we need macro analysis

⇒ Complementarity between micro and macro

6. A CASE OF MICRO-LEVEL OPERATION OF LANGUAGE IDEOLOGY (SORBIAN CASE)





Sorbian today mostly used in the historically rather small Catholic area (Kimura 2014 Slovo a slovesnost, 2015 Int Journal of Soc. Lang)



Kimura 2015, *IJSL* 232

Preparation class for the Holy Communion

- priest: A Anne? [And Anne?]
- Anne: Moja mać spinka, weil sie Nachtschicht hat. [My mother sleeps, because she has to work at night.]

priest: *Aha, ta je spała.* To ja wěrju. (...) [Aha, she was sleeping. I believe that.] Language management process by the priest

- noting: the use of German as deviation from the norm
 - adjustment design: back to Sorbian
 - implementation: repeating correctly and continuing in Sorbian
 - feedback: need to promote the Sorbian skills of Anne

Anne pjenknje čita, ale dokelz staršej nje... to staj staršej wina. Wona je mudra. [Anne can read well, but the parents don't ... the parents are guilty. She is clever.] (2001.3.15)

In the broader context

Extraordinary management, unthinkable outside the church where German dominates.

Norm in the society: When one speaks German, the other(s) has(have) to accommodate to German Ideology of the local Catholic church to valorize Sorbian

- methodology: recurrent narratives and discourse patterns in journals and documents, interviews (Kimura 2005)
- -> Language Ideology no. 204 (!)

Jazykový sakralizmus (Lanstyák 2016, Working papers in LMT 1)

e.g. adding the transmission of the ancestral language to the decalogue ("Honor your father and your mother")

Different (?) interests

 Clergy and leaders: 'When Sorbian disappears, the faith will disappear, too.' (maintaining influence)

- Lay people: try to maximally include also linguistically peripheral members, e.g. participation in popular events related to the church
 - (maintaining community and network)

Power by consent

locally:

(potentially physical?) power of the priest upon his peupils

broader context:

acceptance of the role of Sorbian in the church (language ideology)



7. CONCLUSIONS

- Interest and power is profoundly related to language.
- LMT has good preconditions to tackle these issues.
- Interest and power, however, are not sufficiently integrated in LMT conceptually and methodically.
- A full integration of Language Ideology (LI) would be useful.
- In order to grant the analysis of interest and power the place which it deserves in LMT, LI has to be conceived as relevant to macro as well as micro processes.

Revision 4: ideology as ingredient to LMT

- 0 norms or expectations Ideology:
- 1 noting
- 2 evaluation
- 3 adjustment design
- 4 implementation
- 5 feedback (verification)

sociocultural/ socioeonomic

- communicative
- linguistic

Ideology in the process cycle



General descriptions of LMT

LMT "includes 'ideology' as a concept in the institutional or organized management of linguistic practice" (Bárat, Studer and Nekvapil (eds.) 2013, introduction, 3)

"organized management can be characterized by the following features: (...)

d. Theorizing and ideologies are at play to a greater degree and more explicitly"

(Nekvapil 2012 JAPC: 167, Nekvapil/Sherman 2015 IJSL: 8)

"Simple and Organized Language Management"

http://languagemanagement.ff.cuni.cz/en/complexity

"In very complex networks, organized management often becomes the subject of public or semi-public discussion among a large number of participants (including specialists, institutions), many of them referencing various theories or ideologies."

Concrete proposal

Add to the description of LMT at: http://languagemanagement.ff.cuni.cz/en/complexity the following sentence:

LMT includes 'ideology' as a concept in the institutional or organized <u>as well as simple</u> management of linguistic practice *(with references)*.

ご清聴ありがとうございました
Thank you!
Danke!
Dźakuju so!